"Qira'aah Khalfal Imaam" (Reciting Qiraa'ah while Following the Imaam)

Question: The Ghayr Muqallideen regard Qiraa'ah Khalfal Imaam as Fardh (obligatory) and prove their point by quoting the Hadith: "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)." They claim that the Hanafis oppose this Hadith and also say that one cannot contradict a Hadith that appears in Bukhaari and Muslim. People are now in doubt. We would therefore appreciate a detailed reply in the light of the Qur'aan and the Ahadeeth, especially quoting the proofs of the Hanafis and their replies to the others. Your reply will be a cause of guidance and will Inshaa Allaah dispel the wrong notions of the masses.

Answer: This issue is a point of great contention and difference of opinion. One cannot prove himself by presenting only a portion of a Hadith because a decision can be made only by studying all the various Ahadeeth.

The Hadith you quoted refers to the salaah of a person performing salaah by himself (and applies also to an Imaam). It does not refer to the salaah of a Muqtadi. The following is an extract from Sahih Tirmidhi from the famous Muhaddith and Mujtahid Imaam Ahmad bin Hambal رحمه الله:

"Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله states that when Rasulullaah ρ said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab" he was referring to the person performing salaah by himself. He proves this point by quoting a Hadith in which Hadhrat Jaabir τ said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." Here we have a companion of Rasulullaah ρ interpreting the words "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab" as a person performing salaah individually.[1]

Although this narration quotes the words of Hadhrat Jaabir τ, a narration of Tahaawi[2] quotes the words from Rasulullaah ρ himself. Imaam Abu Dawood رحمه الله has reported that even according to Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayna رحمه الله, the Hadith refers to a person who performs salaah by himself.[3] The stance of the Hanafis therefore conforms with the Ahadeeth and the narrations of the Sahabah ψ and Taabi'een.

The Qur'aan states: **"When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you."[4]**

The chief of the Mufassireen Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mughaffal τ both state that this verse refers to the Fardh (obligatory) salaah.[5] Allaama Ibn Kaatheer رحمه الله adds further that the same

---

[1] Tirmidhi (Vol.1 Pg.42).
[2] Vol.1 Pg.107.
[3] Abu Dawood (Vol.1 Pg.126).
[4] Surah A'raaf, verse 204.
[5] The *Tafseer* of Ibn Katheer (Vol.3 Pg.623).

interpretation has been stated by Hadhrat Mujaahid رحمه الله, as quoted by Hadhrat Sufyaan Thowri رحمه الله and several other scholars. In fact, the same opinion is shared by Hadhrat Sa'eed bin Jubayr رحمه الله, Hadhrat Dahhaak رحمه الله, Hadhrat Qataadah رحمه الله, Hadhrat Ibraheem Nahka'ee رحمه الله, Hadhrat Sha'bi رحمه الله Hadhrat Suddi رحمه الله and Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Zaid bin Aslam رحمه الله.[6]

Ma'aalimut Tanzeel[7] states, "Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ reports that this verse was revealed because some Sahabah ψ used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah ρ in salaah … When Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ heard some people reciting as they followed the Imaam, he turned to them after the salaah and said, "Has the time still not arrived for you to understand the verse: '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you**'". Hadhrat Hasan رحمه الله, Hadhrat Zuhri رحمه الله and Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله have stated that this verse refers to salaah."

Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله has stated, "People are unanimous about the fact that this verse refers to salaah."[8] Imaam Zaid bin Aslam رحمه الله and Hadhrat Abul Aaliya رحمه الله said, "Because some Sahabah ψ used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah ρ in salaah, Allaah revealed the verse: **When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it** *(stop talking)* **and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you."** [9]

The *Tafseer* of Ibn Katheer (Vol.3 Pg.623) also quotes a narration stating that when Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ heard some people reciting as they followed the Imaam, he turned to them after the salaah and said, "Has the time still not arrived for you to understand the Allaah's command when He says: '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you**'".

The following is stated in the book *Al Ikhtiyaar*[10]: "A Muqtadi will not recite Qiraa'ah during the salaah because Allaah states: '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.**'". This is because Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ and many Mufassireen state that the verse was revealed when some Sahabah ψ used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah ρ in salaah.

The book *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.241) also quotes several narrations in this regard. All of the above make it clear that the Muqtadi should remain silent while the Imaam is reciting the Qiraa'ah in both audible and silent salaahs. The verse of the Qur'aan gives two explicit commands. The first is the command to listen attentively (to the recitation of the Imaam), which refers especially to the audible salaahs. The second is the command to remain silent (while the Imaam is reciting), which refers to both silent and audible salaahs.[11]

---

[6] The *Tafseer* of Ibn Katheer (Vol.3 Pg.623).
[7] *Ma'aalimut Tanzeel* with the *Tafseer* of Ibn Katheer (Vol.3 Pg.623).
[8] *Al Mughni* (Vol.1 Pg.601).
[9] *Al Mughni* (Vol.1 Pg.601).
[10] Vol.1 Pg.52.
[11] *Fat'hul Qadeer* (Vol.1 Pg.342).

AHADEETH ON THE SUBJECT

1. Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari τ says, "Rasulullaah ρ delivered a sermon in which he explained the Sunnah to us as well as the manner of performing salaah. He said, 'When you stand up for salaah, form your rows with one of you as the Imaam. When he calls out the Takbeer Tahreema, you also follow suit, but when he recites, you remain silent. Then, you say 'Aameen' when he recites:

غَيرِ المَغضُوبِ عَلَيهِمْ وَلاَ الضَّآلِّينَ

This Hadith is narrated in Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.174). When one of Imaam Muslim رحمه الله's students asked him whether the narration of Imaam Sulaymaan Taymi رحمه الله was authentic, which states that Rasulullaah ρ added, "When he (the Imaam) recites, then you (the Muqtadi) remain silent." To this, Imaam Muslim رحمه الله replied, "Do you wish to know of someone with a memory better than Sulaymaan's?" This indicates that even though Imaam Sulaymaan رحمه الله was the only one to narrate the addition, his narration is perfectly authentic.[12]

In reality, however, there are other narrations of reliable narrators that are the same as that of Hadhrat Sulaymaan Taymi رحمه الله. Moulana Zafar Ahmad Thanwi رحمه الله has narrated a report from Sahih Abu Awaana, which is narrated from Abdullaah bin Rushayd, who then narrates from Abu Ubaydah (Mujaa'ah bin Zuhayr Atki), Qataadah, Yunus bin Jubayr, Hattaan bin Abdullaah Raqaashi and then Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari τ. This narration also states that Rasulullaah ρ said, "but when the Imaam recites, you remain silent. Then, you say 'Aameen' when he recites:

غَيرِ المَغضُوبِ عَلَيهِمْ وَلاَ الضَّآلِّينَ

The narrator Abu Ubaydah رحمه الله is a reliable narrator and *Ansaab Sam'aani* states that the narrations of both Abdullaah bin Rushayd رحمه الله and Abu Ubaydah رحمه الله are reliable.

Daar Qutni has also reported the narration in his Sunan. In his narration, Umar bin Aamir and Sa'eed bin Abu Urwa رحمه الله have narrated from Qataadah رحمه الله a report like that of Sulaymaan Taymi رحمه الله. This narration also adds: "…but when the Imaam recites, you remain silent." Imaam Muslim رحمه الله narrates from Umar bin Aamir رحمه الله as well as from his student Saalim bin Nooh رحمه الله. Apart from Imaam Muslim رحمه الله, Imaam Aby Khuzaymah رحمه الله and Ibn Hibbaan رحمه الله also narrate from him. The belief of certain Muhadditheen that only Sulaymaan Taymi رحمه الله has reported the addition is therefore wrong. It has also been reports from three students of Qataadah رحمه الله, all of whom are reliable narrators.

---

[12] Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.174).

2. The following is quoted from Nasa'ee: "Interpreting the verse '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.**'", Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ said, 'Rasulullaah ρ said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does, be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah and say "**اللهم ربنا لك الحمد**" when he says "**سمع الله لمن حمده**",'"[13]

3. Ibn Maajah narrates: "Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ narrates that Rasulullaah ρ said, ", 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does, be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah, say "**آمين**" when he says "**غير المَغضُوبِ عَلَيهِمْ وَ لا الضَّالِين**" and say "**اللهم ربنا لك الحمد**" when he says "**سمع الله لمن حمده**",'"[14]

   Both the narrations of Nasa'ee and Ibn Maajah are authentic. When a student of Imaam Muslim رحمه الله called Abu Bakr رحمه الله and asked him about the narration of Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ, he replied that it was authentic.[15] This Hadith makes it clear that the Muqtadi should not recite anything behind the Imaam. It has also become clear that the Hadith clarifies the verse **When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.'".**

4. Tirmidhi reports that Hadhrat Jaabir τ said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." Imaam Tirmidhi رحمه الله adds that the narration is *Hasan Sahih*.[16]

5. Imaam Tahaawi رحمه الله narrates the same Hadith from Rasulullaah ρ. He writes, "Hadhrat Jaabir τ reports that Rasulullaah ρ said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam."[17]

   This narration mentions specifically that it is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Surah Faatiha when following the Imaam.

6. The Mu'atta of Imaam Maalik رحمه الله states: "Hadhrat Naafi رحمه الله reports that when Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ was asked whether a Muqtadi should recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, 'When any of you performs salaah behind an Imaam, the recitation of the Imaam suffices for him as well. However, when he performs salaah by himself, he should recite the Qiraa'ah.' Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ himself would not recite any Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam.[18]

---

[13] Nasa'ee (Vol.1 Pg.93) and *Mishkaatul Masaabeeh* (Pg.81).
[14] Ibn Maajah (Pg.61).
[15] Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.174).
[16] Tirmidhi (Vol.1 Pg.42).
[17] Tahaawi (Vol.1 Pg.107).
[18] *Mu'atta* of Imaam Maalik (pg.29) and *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad (pg.75).

Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.251) states: "Allaama Ayni رحمه الله said, 'Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ would not recite the Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam and he was one who followed most closely in the footsteps of Rasulullaah ρ.'"

7. Ibn Maajah[19] reports from Hadhrat Jaabir τ that Rasulullaah ρ said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well."

8. The *Musnad* of Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله states[20]: "Hadhrat Jaabir τ reports that Rasulullaah ρ said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.'"

9. The Mu'atta of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله states[21]: "Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله reported to us from Abul Hasan Moosa bin Abu Aa'isha رحمه الله, from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad رحمه الله, from Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah τ that Rasulullaah ρ said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well."

10. *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.248) states: "Hadhrat Jaabir τ reports that Rasulullaah ρ said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.' This has been narrated by Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله, Daar Qutni رحمه الله and Bayhaqi رحمه الله from our Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله , a chain of narrators that is most authentic. In fact, Allaama Ibn Humaam رحمه الله has asserted that the narration conforms with the standards of authenticity used by Imaam Bukhaari رحمه الله and Imaam Muslim رحمه الله. Allaama Ayni رحمه الله says, "The narration is authentic. As for Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله, he was after all, Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله. Moosa bin Abu Aa'isha رحمه الله is amongst the reliable and dependable narrators from whom Bukhaari and Muslim narrate. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad رحمه الله was amongst the leading and most dependable scholars of Shaam. The narration is therefore Sahih."

11. The Mu'atta[22] of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله quotes another narration as follows: "Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad رحمه الله reports that Rasulullaah ρ once led the Sahabah ψ in Asr salaah. When one of the Sahabah ψ started to recite Qiraa'ah, the Sahabi τ beside him indicated to him to remain silent. When the salaah was over, the Sahabi τ asked, 'Why did you indicate to me to remain silent?' The other replied, 'Rasulullaah ρ was in front of us and I did not want you to recite behind him. Overhearing this conversation, Rasulullaah ρ then said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.'"

12. *Kitaabul Aathaar*[23] contains the following: "Hadhrat Jaabir τ reports that Rasulullaah ρ was leading the salaah when a Sahabi τ started to recite

[19] Pg.61.
[20] Pg.133.
[21] Pg.77.
[22] Pg.78.
[23] Pg.23.

Qiraa'ah. Another Sahabi τ stopped him from reciting Qiraa'ah in salaah and a dispute arose between the two, with the first saying, 'Why do you prevent me from reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah ρ?' When their dispute reached Rasulullaah ρ's ears, he said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.' Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله says, 'It is this practice that we follow and such is the opinion of Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله.

13. *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.250) reports from Hadhrat Ali τ that someone once asked Rasulullaah ρ, "Should I recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam or should I remain silent?" "No," Rasulullaah ρ replied, "you should remain silent because his Qiraa'ah suffices for you."

14. *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.250) reports another narration from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ in which Rasulullaah ρ said, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for you, whether he recites silently or audibly." This narration is from Daar Qutni.

15. Muslim[24] reports from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ that Rasulullaah ρ said, "When the Qaari (reciter of Qiraa'ah, viz. the Imaam) says, " غيرِ المَغضُوبِ عَلَيهِمْ وَ لا الضَّالِين" and those following him say, "آمين", all their previous sins are forgiven if their "آمين" corresponds with the "آمين" of the angels."

This Hadith refers to performing salaah in Jamaa'ah and refers only to the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam, making it apparent that it is only the Imaam who needs to recite. Had it been necessary for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah, the Hadith would not have spoken about the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam only. The Hadith also indicates that the responsibility of reciting Surah Faatiha is that of the Imaam.

16. A narration of Bukhaari[25] reports from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ that Rasulullaah ρ said, "When the Qaari (reciter of Qiraa'ah, viz. the Imaam) says 'Aameen', you also say 'Aameen' because the angels also says 'Aameen' and all the previous sins of a person are forgiven when his 'Aameen' corresponds with that of the angels."

In this Hadith as well, the Qaari refers to the one who recites the Qiraa'ah, which is the Imaam only. If everyone needed to recite Qiraa'ah, Rasulullaah ρ would have said, "When you all say, " غيرِ المَغضُوبِ عَلَيهِمْ وَ لا الضَّالِين", then say, "آمين".

Apart from the above, there are several statements of the Sahabah ψ and Taabi'een and reports about them to support the stance of the Hanafis. We shall now present these.

REPORTS FROM THE SAHABAH ψ

[24] Vol.1 Pg.176.
[25] Vol.2 Pg.947.

Hadhrat Moosa bin Aqaba رحمه الله says that Rasulullaah ρ, Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ, Hadhrat Umar τ and Hadhrat Uthmaan τ all prevented people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.[26]

Another narration from a Taabi'ee states that Hadhrat Umar τ took a pledge from the people that they would not recite Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.[27]

ABOUT HADHRAT ALI τ

Hadhrat Ali τ said, "The person who recites when following the Imaam is not upon *Fitrah*."[28]

Hadhrat Ali τ also said, "The one who recites when following the Imaam conflicts with *Fitrah*."[29]

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN MAS'OOD τ

A man once approached Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ and asked, "Should I recite Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam?" Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ replied, "Remain silent because there are other things to occupy you when performing salaah (such as contemplating about the commands, promises and warnings in the Qur'aan). The Imaam will do the recitation for you."[30]

Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais رحمه الله reports that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ would not recite Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam, regardless of whether the salaah was silent or audible and whether it was the first two Rakaahs or the second two Rakaahs. However when he performed salaah by himself, he would recite both Surah Faatiha and a Surah in the first two Rakaahs and only Surah Faatiha in the second two Rakaahs.[31]

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN ABBAAS τ

Hadhrat Abu Hamza رحمه الله reports that he once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ whether he should recite any Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam. "No," came the reply.[32]

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN UMAR τ

1. Hadhrat Ibn Seereen رحمه الله reports that he once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ whether he should recite any Qiraa'ah when following an

---

[26] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.139), as quoted in *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.250).
[27] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.138), as quoted in *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.251).
[28] Tahaawi (Vol.1 Pg.107) and *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.251).
[29] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.1 Pg.137).
[30] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.138) and the *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.78).
[31] The *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.78).
[32] Tahaawi (Vol.1 Pg.108).

Imaam. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ replied, "You seem to have a large belly. The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you."[33]

2. Hadhrat Zaid bin Aslam رحمه الله says that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ used to prevent people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.[34]

3. Hadhrat Naafi رحمه الله reports that when someone asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you."[35]

4. When someone once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you."[36]

ABOUT HADHRAT ZAID BIN THAABIT τ

Hadhrat Ataa bin Yasaar رحمه الله narrates that when Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ was asked about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "Under no circumstances must a person recite when following an Imaam." Imaam Muslim رحمه الله has also reported this narration.[37]

Hadhrat Dhakwaan رحمه الله reports that both Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ used to prohibit people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.[38]

Hadhrat Ataa bin Yasaar رحمه الله reports that he heard Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ say, "In no salaah should one recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam."[39]

ABOUT HADHRAT JAABIR BIN ABDULLAAH τ

Hadhrat Jaabir said, "Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam should neither take place in audible or silent salaahs."[40]

Hadhrat Ubaydullaah bin Muqsim رحمه الله asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ, Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ and Hadhrat Jaabir τ about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. They all told him that in no salaah should a person recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.[41]

When Hadhrat Ubaydullaah bin Muqsim رحمه الله asked Hadhrat Jaabir τ whether he recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in the Zuhr and Asr salaahs, he replied in the negative.[42]

---

[33] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.140).
[34] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.140).
[35] The *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.76).
[36] The *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.77).
[37] *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.251) and Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.251).
[38] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.1 Pg.140).
[39] Tahaawi (Vol.1 Pg.108).
[40] Ibn Abi Shaybah, as quoted in *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.251).
[41] *Tahaawi (Vol.1 Pg.107).*
[42] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.141).

ABOUT HADHRAT ALQAMA BIN QAIS رحمه الله

Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله reports that Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais رحمه الله said, "I would prefer biting on a burning charcoal rather than reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam."[43]

Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله reports that Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais رحمه الله never recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam regardless of whether the salaah was silent or audible, whether it was the second two Rakaahs, whether it was Surah Faatiha or any other Surah.[44]

ABOUT HADHRAT MUHAMMAD BIN SEEREEN τ

Hadhrat Muhammad bin Seereen رحمه الله said, "As far as I know, reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is not Sunnah."[45]

ABOUT HADHRAT SUWAYD BIN GHAFALA τ

Hadhrat Waleed bin Qais رحمه الله reports that when he asked Hadhrat Suwayd bin Ghafala رحمه الله (an eminent Taabi'ee whom some even regard as a Sahabi) about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in the Zuhr and Asr salaahs, he replied that it should not be done.[46]

ABOUT HADHRAT IBRAHEEM NAKHA'EE رحمه الله

Hadhrat Mansoor رحمه الله reports that Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله said, "The first person to read Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was someone against whom many accusations have been levelled (someone not perfectly reliable)."[47]

Moulana Zafar Ahmad Thanwi رحمه الله writes that Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله was amongst the leading Fuqahaa of Kufa and the first person to start reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was most probably some Khaariji or Qadri. Whereas the people of Kufa always followed the teachings of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ and would not recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, it was this person who introduced it to the people of Kufa. The statement of Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله does not however mean that the people of Makkah and Hijaaz who recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam were perpetrators of Bid'ah and people who stood accused of wrong.[48]

Apart from the above, there are many other narrations, which we have omitted.

---

[43] The *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.78).
[44] *Kitaabul Aathaar* (Pg.22).
[45] Ibn Abi Shaybah (Vol.1 Pg.377).
[46] Ibn Abi Shaybah (Vol.1 Pg.377).
[47] The *Mu'atta* of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله (Pg.78)
[48] *Faatihatul Kalaam* (Pg.41).

Zujaajatul Masaabeeh states that the verse of the Qur'aan gives two explicit commands. The first is the command to listen attentively (to the recitation of the Imaam), which refers especially to the audible salaahs. The second is the command to remain silent (while the Imaam is reciting), which refers to the silent salaahs. It is this practice that has been adopted by Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله and his companions and has been stated by Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah τ, Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ, Hadhrat Ali τ, Hadhrat Umar τ, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Sufyaan Thowri رحمه الله, Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayna رحمه الله, Hadhrat Ibn Abi Layla رحمه الله, Hadhrat Hasan bin Saalih رحمه الله, Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee رحمه الله and the students of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, together with other eminent Sahabah ψ and Taabi'een رحمه الله. This has been stated by Ibn Abdul Birr in his *Istidhkaar wat Tamheed*. Allaama Ayni رحمه الله has also reported that more than eighty eminent Sahabah ψ have prohibited people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam and their names have bee cited by the Muhadditheen. Amongst them are Hadhrat Ali τ and the three Abdullaahs (Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ). It has also been stated that more than eighty people issued Fataawaa to this effect during that period of time and their unanimity is on the status of Ijmaa. Imaam Abdullaah bin Ya'qoob Haarithi Sabdhoomi رحمه الله writes in his book *Kashful Asraar* that Hadhrat Zaid bin Aslam τ said, "Ten Sahabah ψ of Rasulullaah ρ vehemently prohibited people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. They were Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ, Hadhrat Umar τ, Hadhrat Uthmaan τ, Hadhrat Ali τ, Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Auf τ, Hadhrat Sa'd bin Abi Waqqaas τ, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit τ, Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ."[49]

The book *Ikhtiyaar* states "A Muqtadi will not recite Qiraa'ah during the salaah because Allaah states: '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.**'". This is because Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ and many Mufassireen state that the verse was explicitly revealed when some Sahabah ψ used to recite loudly as they followed Rasulullaah ρ in salaah. It has also been reported from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ that Rasulullaah ρ said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah.' Rasulullaah ρ also said, 'When a person follows an Imaam, the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for him.' Imaam Sha'bi رحمه الله has also reported that Rasulullaah ρ said, 'No Qiraa'ah should be recited when following an Imaam.'"[50]

***Rasaa'ilul Arkaan* (Vol.1 Pg.101) states that the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for the follower according to the Hanafi, Hambali and Maaliki schools of jurisprudence.** The proof stems from the Hadith of Hadhrat Jaabir τ in which Rasulullaah ρ said, "When a person has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." This Hadith is *Sahih* (authentic) and has been narrated by Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله. Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله has stated in his *Mu'atta* that Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله has

---

[49] *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.242).
[50] *Al Ikhtiyaar Lita'leelil Mukhtaar* (Vol.1 Pg.50).

reported it to him and Ibn Adi رحمه الله has also reported it through his own chain of narrators from Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله. Allaama Ibn Jowzi رحمه الله has ruled that the narration is *Sahih*. The details have been elaborated upon in *Fat'hul Qadeer* together with the chains of narrators. Both chains of narrators end at Rasulullaah ρ, the one from Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله being the more authentic of the two. Our practice in this matter has proven from the practices of eminent Sahabah ψ.

Haafidh Ibn Taymiyyah رحمه الله, whom the Ghayr Muqallideen claim to follow, writes, "The issue is a bone of contention from both camps, but those who prohibit reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam are the majority of scholars form the past and the present. They have the Qur'aan and authentic Ahadeeth to back their claim whereas those who claim that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam have in their support Ahadeeth that the *A'immah* have declared to be weak."[51]

Tafseer Haqqaani reports a narration from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ stating that after leading the salaah on one occasion, Rasulullaah ρ asked the Sahabah ψ if anyone had recited Qiraa'ah behind him. When the Sahabah ψ replied that someone did, Rasulullaah ρ remarked, "I did feel that someone was wrestling with me in reciting." From that day onwards, the Sahabah ψ no longer recited Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah ρ in the audible salaahs. Tirmidhi has declared the Hadith as *Hasan*. The same type of narration has been reported from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Imraan bin Husayn τ and Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah τ.

Muslim has also reported a narration in which Rasulullaah ρ said, "The Imaam has been appointed to be followed…" This Hadith adds that Rasulullaah ρ also said, "…so be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah." Furthermore, Hadhrat Jaabir τ said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." This Hadith has been declared to be *Hasan Sahih*. Imaam Tahaawi رحمه الله has reported these words from Rasulullaah ρ and several Muhadditheen including Imaams Ahmad رحمه الله and Maalik رحمه الله have also reported it.

Apart from the above, there are sevral other narrations from Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله and Ibn Abi Shaybah رحمه الله substantiating the view that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is prohibited. It is in view of all of this that Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله has instructed Muqtadis to remain silent when following the Imaam. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood τ, Hadhrat Jaabir τ and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ also did not recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله and other Muhadditheen have emphasised the recitation of Surah Faatiha. **However, they say that the Muqtadi will recite it only when the Imaam pauses after reciting it first.** They prove their opinion

[51] *Tanawwu'ul Ibaadaat* (Pg.86)

by quoting a Hadith in which Rasulullaah ρ said, "Whoever performs salaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan, his salaah will be incomplete." However, the Muhadditheen, especially Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله who is the Imaam of Muhadditheen state that this Hadith refers to the person who is performing salaah by himself and is not following an Imaam. When this is the meaning of the Hadith, it will therefore be implausible to assert that it restricts the purport of the verse of the Qur'aan, especially when Imaam Bayhaqi رحمه الله has stated that the verse was revealed with reference to salaah.[52]

Sheikhul Islaam Hadhrat Moulana Husayn Ahmad Madani رحمه الله says that there are several apparent points of rationale making the Hanafi point of view evident. The first is that there are no narrations stating without ambiguity that it is Waajib (compulsory) to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Since this is an act that happens ever so often and is of such importance, the absence of a clear narration makes it evident that it is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

The second point is that if reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was Waajib (compulsory), there needs to be a time within the salaah when he ought to be reciting. The Imaam would then be instructed when to pause his Qiraa'ah so that the Muqtadi may recite. There is however no such instruction mentioned. This proves that Qiraa'ah is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi because why would the time not be mentioned for something that is compulsory when times are mentioned for things that are Mustahab, such as saying "ربنا لك الحمد" and "آمين".[53]

1. With regard to the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah τ, Imaam Sufyana bin Uyaynah رحمه الله and Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله both state that it does not refer to the Muqtadi. The Hadith therefore does not apply to all people performing salaah and regarding it to be such will result in contradicting narrations such as "unless he is behind an Imaam" and "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." Adopting the approach of the Hanafis will prevent assuming such a contradiction because each Hadith will have an independent application; one referring to the Muqtadi and the other to the Munfarid.

2. Most of the Sahabah ψ and all of the A'immah maintain that the person who joins the Imaam only in Ruku has made it for the Rakaah. This is also established from a Hadith in which Rasulullaah ρ said, "If you come for salaah and find us in Sajdah, make the Sajdah but do not count it. As for the one who makes it for the Ruku, he has made it for the Rakaah."[54] Now the person joining only in the Ruku does not recite Surah Faatiha, yet even those who claim that Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is Waajib say that the person has made it for the Rakaah. They are constrained to say this because of this clear-cut Hadith.

[52] Tafseer Haqqaani (Vol.4 Pg.182).
[53] *Ma'aarife Madaniyyah* (Vol.5 Pg.106).
[54] Abu Dawood, as quoted in *Mishkaatul Masaabeeh* (Pg.102).

3. While people use the Hadith "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)" to substantiate their claim, this Hadith is reported with the addition of the words "and more". This means that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and more (additional verses of the Qur'aan). This addition has been narrated by Imaam Muslim رحمه الله (Vol.1 Pg.169)[55].

   Although some Muhadditheen say that the narrator Hadhrat Ma'mar رحمه الله is the only one who has reported the addition, they are mistaken because other reliable narrators have also reported it. Examples of such narrators are Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayah رحمه الله in a narration of Abu Dawood, narrating from Imaam Zuhri رحمه الله. Hadhrat Saalih bin Kaysaan رحمه الله , Imaam Awzaa'ee رحمه الله, Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Is'haaq رحمه الله and others have also reported the same addition as Hadhrat Ma'mar رحمه الله.[56]

   This addition is also substantiated in other Ahadeeth, such as a narration from Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri τ in which he states, "Rasulullaah ρ instructed us to recite Surah Faatiha and whatever else of the Qur'aan that is easy for us." Another narration states that Rasulullaah ρ said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha) and some more."[57] The following narrations also reinforce this:

   Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ reports that Rasulullaah ρ instructed him to announce that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha) and some more.[58]

   Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri τ narrates that Rasulullaah ρ said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and a Surah in every Rakaah of the Fardh (obligatory) and other salaahs."[59]

   The above narrations tell us that the recitation of Surah Faatiha together with another few verses of the Qur'aan should be Fardh (obligatory), whereas this is not the case even according to those who claim that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is necessary. Now why would they practise on one part of the Hadith and forsake the other without any justification? This reinforces the viewpoint of the Hanafis that reciting Qiraa'ah is not necessary for the Muqtadi, but it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Imaam and the Munfarid to recite Surah Faatiha together with a Surah or a few verses of the Qur'aan.

The gist of it all is that it is wrong to claim that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam because just as the Sutrah

---

[55] *Mishkaatul Masaabeeh* (Pg.78)
[56] *Faatihatul Kalaam pg.58.*
[57] Abu Dawood (Vol.1 Pg.125).
[58] Abu Dawood (Vol.1 Pg.125).
[59] Ibn Maajah (Pg.61).

of the Imaam suffices for the Muqtadi, so too does the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffice for the Muqtadi whether it be during audible or silent salaahs. It is therefore clear that it is wrong to claim that the view of the Hanafi Madh'hab is wrong.

It is believed that Hadhrat Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله was of the opinion that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in all types of salaah. However, in his final and famous work *Kitaabul Umm*, he has the following to say: "It is Waajib (compulsory) for the Munfarid and the Imaam to recite Surah Faatiha in every Rakaah. No other Surah will suffice in its place. I also prefer that a verse or more of the Qur'aan be recited with it. I shall soon mention the ruling with regard to the Muqtadi, Inshaa Allaah."[60]

He then states the ruling of the Muqtadi in volume 7 when he says, "We state that the Muqtadi should reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in every salaah in which the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam cannot be heard."[61]

This statement of Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله makes it apparent that it is incorrect for the Muqtadi to recite Surah Faatiha behind the Imaam when performing the audible salaahs. He has specified that Qiraa'ah be recited behind the Imaam only in the silent salaahs.

To compete the above reply, it is appropriate to cite the words of Hadhrat Moulana Idrees Kandhalwi رحمه الله , which will shed further light on the issue. While I had originally intended to give a brief reply to this question, the reply has become lengthy and although the following would add to the body of the reply, I have decided to include it because it is so beneficial. Had I seen this earlier, I would have sufficed by quoting it after a brief reply.
Hadhrat Moulana writes that according to Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله, it is not permissible for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam regardless of whether the salaah is silent or audible. It is by their deduction that Imaams Ahmad رحمه الله and Maalik رحمه الله differentiate between the silent and audible salaahs. As has been stated, the verse of the Qur'aan (**"When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent"**), it refers to both silent and audible salaahs. The Ahadeeth of Rasulullaah ρ exhorting silence and attentive listening do not differentiate between silent and audible salaahs. Rasulullaah ρ expressed displeasure at the Sahabah ψ's recitation behind him when it occurred during the Fajr salaah and also during the Zuhr salaah. He used the word "wrestling" as well as "confusing" when admonishing the Sahabah ψ for reciting Qiraa'ah behind him. **There was no differentiation between silent and audible salaahs.**

In fact, a report states that Rasulullaah ρ once led the Sahabah ψ in the Asr salaah. When one of the Sahabah ψ started to recite Qiraa'ah, the Sahabi τ

---

[60] Vol.1 Pg.93.
[61] *Kitaabul Umm* (Vol.7 Pg.153).

beside him indicated to him to remain silent. When the salaah was over, the Sahabi τ asked, 'Why did you indicate to me to remain silent?' The other replied, 'Rasulullaah ρ was in front of us and I did not want you to recite behind him. Overhearing this conversation, Rasulullaah ρ then said, **'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.'"**[62]

This means that there is no need for the Muqtadi reciting Qiraa'ah because the Imaam is already doing so. This is similar to the verse of the Qur'aan in which Allaah says: **"Does it not suffice for them that We have revealed the Book to you."** This tells us that when the Qur'aan suffices to guide mankind, there is no need for another scripture.

The above narration makes it evident that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is an act that is disliked since Rasulullaah ρ endorsed the words of the Sahabi τ. This incident took place during the Asr salaah, which is a silent salaah, making it clear that the ruling does not change from salaah to salaah.

It is this what Hadhrat Jaabir τ stated in a Hadith that is authentic without any doubt. The same has been stated by Hadhrat Abu Dardaa τ when he quotes that Rasulullaah ρ said, "When the Imaam recites Qiraa'ah, it will certainly suffice for the Muqtadi."[63]

THE KHULAFAA RAASHIDEEN: Hadhrat Moosa bin Aqaba رحمه الله says that Rasulullaah ρ, Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ, Hadhrat Umar τ and Hadhrat Uthmaan τ all prevented people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.[64] Haafidh Ayni رحمه الله states that this narration is authentic.

HADHRAT UMAR τ: Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله quotes Hadhrat Umar τ as saying, "I wish that stones could be filled into the mouth of the person who recites Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam."

HADHRAT ALI τ: Hadhrat Ali τ said, "The one who recites when following the Imaam conflicts with *Fitrah*."[65]

We have thus far concentrated on research findings and examining narrations of Ahadeeth because the nature of the subject is one dealing with Fiqh and Ahadeeth.

The following is quoted from Nasa'ee: "Interpreting the verse '**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.'"**, Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah τ said, 'Rasulullaah ρ said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does, be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah and say "**اللهم ربنا لك الحمد**" when he says " **سمع**

---

[62] The Mu'atta[62] of Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله
[63] Tabraani. The chain of narrators is authentic.
[64] Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.2 Pg.139), as quoted in *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh* (Vol.1 Pg.250).
[65] Ibn Abi Shaybah and Abdur Razzaaq (Vol.1 Pg.137).

الله لمن حمده"," [66] This Hadith makes it clear that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to remain silent and to listen attentively to the recitation of the Imaam and it does not specify the silence for the Surah only.

A FINE POINT: A fine line of difference between the verse of Surah A'raaf and the Hadith is that while the Hadith speaks about remaining silent, the verse of the Qur'aan speaks about both remaining silent as well as listening attentively. This is because the Qur'aan is sometimes recited silently and sometimes audibly. The ruling when the Qiraa'ah is audible is to listen attentively and when it is silent, the ruling is to remain silent. The purpose of the verse is to expound the rulings applicable to Qiraa'ah, whereas the purpose of the Hadith is to expound the ruling with regards to the Muqtadi. It instructs the Muqtadi to remain silent regardless of whether the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is audible or not and whether the Muqtadi is listening attentively or not. The Hadith therefore mentions only the instruction to remain silent, without any reference to attentive listening.

In fact, from the very beginning when salaah was made Fardh (obligatory) up to the time that Rasulullaah ρ passed away, it has always been the practice for the Imaam to recite the Qiraa'ah and for the Muqtadi to listen in silence. When some Sahabah ψ decided to recite Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah ρ out of their own discretion, they were prevented from doing so by the revelation of the verse "**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you**". Even when Rasulullaah ρ went to Masjidul Aqsa before leaving for the Mi'raaj, all the Ambiyaa عليهم السلام and the high-ranking angels waited for him to lead the salaah and none of them recited Surah Faatiha as Rasulullaah ρ recited the Qiraa'ah in salaah.

When someone did reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah ρ, he asked, "It appears that some of you are reciting Qiraa'ah behind your Imaam?" It is therefore evident that Rasulullaah ρ never instructed or encouraged reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

When Rasulullaah ρ was suffering his final illness, he had instructed Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ to lead the salaahs. As Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ was leading the Fajr salaah, Rasulullaah ρ was feeling a bit better and arrived in the Masjid. Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ then stepped back and Rasulullaah ρ proceeded to lead the salaah, continuing the Qiraa'ah from where Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ had left off.[67] Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ was then busy reciting a Surah. Rasulullaah ρ therefore did not recite Surah Faatiha in this final salaah that he led or any of the Qiraa'ah that Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ has already recited.

The Qiraa'ah of Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ sufficed for all, just as Rasulullaah ρ said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." There are therefore two types of Qiraa'ah according to this Hadith;

---

[66] Nasa'ee (Vol.1 Pg.93) and *Mishkaatul Masaabeeh* (Pg.81).
[67] Ahmad (Vol.1 Pg.632) and Daar Qutni (Pg.153) in a narration from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ.

Qiraa'ah Haqeeqi (actual Qiraa'ah) and *Qiraa'ah Hukmi* (Qiraa'ah that is not actual Qiraa'ah, but in shares the same status).

Therefore, if it is assumed that Rasulullaah ρ referred to both the Imaam and Muqtadi when he said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab", then it will be necessary to assume that it also refers to both the types of Qiraa'ah. According to this interpretation, the Qiraa'ah of the Muqtadi in this Hadith with refer to the *Qiraa'ah Hukmi* because Rasulullaah ρ said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." This *Qiraa'ah Hukmi* takes place when the Muqtadi remains silent and listens attentively to the Imaam. By remaining silent, the Muqtadi will therefore be practising on both the verse of the Qur'aan enjoining silence as well as the Hadith invoking *Qiraa'ah Hukmi*. As for the person who recites Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he will be guilty of acting in conflict with the verse of the Qur'aan as well as *wrestling* with the Imaam, which Rasulullaah ρ prohibited. Had Rasulullaah ρ ever instructed the Sahabah ψ to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he would never have reproached the Sahabi τ in question.

UPON FURTHER DELIBERATION: The purpose of Qiraa'ah is either to listen to the commands of Allaah or to engage in conversation with Allaah. If the former is the purpose, then the Imaam is Allaah's ambassador to convey the commands to the people and if it is the latter, then the Imaam is the people's representative before Allaah, who will present the supplications of the people to Him. It is obvious that an ambassador or a representative can be one person only. He will be the Imaam and the Muqtadis will say *Aameen* to his Qiraa'ah. As for the etiquette of worship which includes the Ruku, Sajdah, Tasbeeh and the other postures and acts of the salaah, these are necessary for both the Imaam and the Muqtadis. Representation is not applicable here because the purpose of these acts is to revere Allaah, which is incumbent on every individual. The plea for guidance to the straight path that is stated in Surah Faatiha is adequately presented by the Imaam who represents the entire congregation.

FURTHERMORE: A study of the Qur'aan and Ahadeeth will reveal that the salaah in Jamaa'ah is really a single salaah, which is the salaah of the Imaam. The salaah of the Muqtadis fall within his salaah. It is for this reason that if the Imaam's salaah is nullified, the salaah of the Muqtadis will be nullified, whereas an act on their part nullifying the salaah will not nullify the Imaam's and their salaah. Similarly, the Sutrah of the Imaam will suffice for the Jamaa'ah and preceding the Imaam in any posture is prohibited.

In fact, when the Qur'aan refers to salaah in Jamaa'ah, it refers to one salaah. Examples of this are the verses: **"When they stand up for salaah, they stand up lazily"** and **"When you present yourselves for the salaah, do not approach it in a drunken state".** The singular use of the word salaah indicates that the salaah in Jamaa'ah is one. Therefore, if every Muqtadi has to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, the

salaah will not be one, but it will be several people performing their individual salaahs in one place. This then cannot be termed salaah in Jamaa'ah.

A narration from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas τ[68] states that when Rasulullaah ρ used to lead the Sahabah ψ in salaah during their stay in Makkah, he would recite the Qur'aan loudly, hearing which the Mushrikeen used to swear at the Qur'aan and the One who revealed the Qur'aan. It was then that Allaah revealed the verse "**Do not recite** *(the Qur'aan)* **loudly in your salaah, nor softly, but seek a path in between these** *(two extremes)*". This verse instructs the Imaam to recite in a manner that the Muqtadis can hear because it is their duty to listen and not to recite.

EXPLAINING THE HADITH OF HADHRAT UBAADAH τ

The strongest proof for reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam (as stated by Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله) is the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah τ stating, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)."

In response, the reply from Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله will be that the Hadith in question does not specify the Muqtadi. On the other hand, the verse of Surah A'raaf (**When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you**) was revealed with explicit reference to the Muqtadi. Furthermore, those Sahabah ψ who reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah ρ were reprimanded.

Now it is a principle with Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله that a verse of the Qur'aan with an unspecified meaning may be made specific with a solitary narration of Hadith. It will therefore be obvious that a solitary narration of Hadith with an unspecified meaning may be made specific with a verse of the Qur'aan.

Furthermore, there are also several Ahadeeth that refer specifically to the Muqtadi. Amongst these is the Hadith 'When any of you performs salaah behind an Imaam, the recitation of the Imaam suffices for him as well." This narration is authentic and complies with the standards of authenticity as specified by Imaams Bukhaari رحمه الله and Muslim رحمه الله. It is therefore Apparent that the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah τ refers to the Imaam and the Munfarid, as stated by the teacher of Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله, Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyaynah رحمه الله and reported in the Sunan of Imaam Abu Dawood رحمه الله. Emphasising the same is the narration of Tirmidhi in which Hadhrat Jaabir τ said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam."

Imaam Tirmidhi رحمه الله states that according to Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله (who taught Imaam Bukhaari رحمه الله), the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah رحمه الله does not refer to the Muqtadi but to the person performing salaah by himself. He proves this

---

[68] Bukhaari.

by citing the above narration of Hadhrat Jaabir رحمه الله, which explains that Surah Faatiha is not to be recited if one is following an Imaam.

"Imaam Ahmad bin Hambal رحمه الله said, 'We have never heard anyone from the people of Islaam state that the Muqtadi's salaah is invalid when he does not recite Qiraa'ah as the Imaam does in the audible salaahs. This has never been stated by Rasulullaah ρ, the Sahabah ψ, the Taabi'een, Imaam Maalik رحمه الله from the people of Hijaaz, Imaam Thowri رحمه الله from the people of Iraq, Imaam Awzaa'ee رحمه الله from the people of Shaam or Imaam Layth bin Sa'd رحمه الله from the people of Egypt. None has ever stated that the salaah of the follow is invalid when he does not recite Qiraa'ah."[69]

It has therefore been noted that none of the Sahabah ψ, Taabi'een or pious predecessors advocated reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in audible salaahs. In fact, Imaam Tirmidhi رحمه الله notes that Imaam Shaafi'ee رحمه الله had swayed too much to the extreme when he declared it Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Even Imaam Ibn Taymiyyah رحمه الله has emphasised that it is not permissible and Haraam for a Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam during audible salaahs. Those people in today's times who claim to be followers of the Ahadeeth (*Ahle Hadith*) should study the Fataawaa of Allaama Ibn Taymiyyah رحمه الله.

IN A NUTSHELL

The opinion of Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله is extremely well substantiated by the Qur'aan and Ahadeeth. It also appeals perfectly with logic and common sense. One may refer to the detailed commentaries of *Hidaayah* and Bukhaari for the details.

---

[69] *Al Mughni* (Vol.1 Pg.564). See also (Vol.1 Pg.606) and *Fataawaa Ibn Taymiyyah* (Vol.2 Pg.141-150)